

# IMPACT EVALUATION OF INTERVENTIONS BY THE STATE IN RESPECT OF SELECT SPORTS IN KARNATAKA (2011-12 TO 2016-17)



# KARNATAKA EVALUATION AUTHORITY DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, PROGRAMME MONITORING AND STATISTICS GOVERNMENT OF KARNATAKA OCTOBER 2020

## **Executive Summary**

Sports and games have historically played a significant role in the development of personality traits and qualities like discipline, tolerance, and leadership amongst the youth. With adequate support, planning, and implementation, the immense potential of India's youth can be gainfully channelized through sporting activities. Sporting achievements are increasingly being seen as a medium to express a country's economic supremacy and developmental capacity. Karnataka has a unique opportunity to emerge as a global sports hub, and that requires creating an enabling, inclusive, and dynamic environment for sports in Karnataka. The Karnataka state has been at the top of many sporting disciplines in the country. In essence, not merely a large part of society takes part in the sports, but many excelling sportspersons also have emanated from Karnataka. Sporting excellence and awards have been forthcoming to Karnataka in many fields of sports and even at the State / national/global levels of competition. Although many initiatives are taken by the Government of Karnataka to create excellent sports facilities, they have a long way to improve the capacity of young sportspersons as per international standards.

#### **Objectives:**

The current study aims at throwing light on the nature of change in the sports sector of Karnataka and its impact on the different stakeholders. For the present evaluation, the following sports have been focussed upon: 1) Athletics, 2) Volley Ball, 3) Basket- Ball, 4) Wrestling, 5) Judo, 6) Cycling, 7) Hockey, 8) Kabaddi, 9) Gymnastics, 10) Football Specific objectives and the issues are as under:

- To examine interventions in the listed sports by the state for years 2012-13 to 2016-17.
- To assess the impact of the above-mentioned interventions on individual sportspersons (both achiever and non-achiever) in their chosen sporting field and on the popularity of the sport in the state over the years.
- To analyze the role and extent of involvement of the private sector in the select sports
- To study the views of Associations and Federations of the selected sports concerning the challenges, limitations, infrastructural needs, and opportunities for growth of the respective fields.

#### **Evaluation Methodology:**

The Evaluation study has followed a descriptive and diagnostic research design in assessing the status of sports in Karnataka. The study has used the triangulation method of balancing both qualitative and quantitative data. At the primary level of data gathering, a simple random sample of 1050 respondents was drawn, representing each of the sport listed for the study. Likewise, the other stakeholders, such as the coaches, award winners, representatives of elected office bearers of each of the sport, were also interviewed. A specially designed questionnaire and a structured interview schedule were employed to gather information. Besides, the number of focussed group discussions was held involving the different stakeholders. Data were coded and tabulated by making use of SPSS software.

#### **Major Findings:**

By and large, Karnataka has been making a reasonable budgetary allocation for Sports. Over the years, budgetary has witnessed a rise, but that has never been sufficient and cannot be termed satisfactory. Even during the study period, the two years of 2013-14 and 2015-16 have witnessed a decrease in budgetary allocation. The non-availability of the information on the actual sums allocated and spent for a specific field of sports was a challenge faced during evaluation. Therefore, a comparative statement of expenditure for the development of different sports disciplines was not possible. More meaningful monitoring of performance and impact of each sports facility could have done if such a comparative accounting was maintained and monitored. Despite the weakness in the availability of data at the departmental level, it is evident from the study that increases in the overall budgetary allocation has positively impacted the growth of all the disciplines covered by this evaluation study.

However, not undermining the above finding, it can further be stated that the positive impact need not be understood merely in terms of enrollment in the sports hostel across the districts. It has to be assessed in terms of accomplishments made by the young sportspersons at the state, national and international level competitions. At the first two levels – i.e., the state and national levels, inmates of the different facilities have performed impressively by winning several awards and medals. Nevertheless, this success is not in evidence uniformly at the international level (See Table: 8 and Figure: 4). This study finds that there is a need in each sport field, the identification of the persons with a good track record and impressive

performance as potential winners, and extra attention is given to them for more extended periods even before the actual selection and events.

Further, the study finds that the performance of hostels meant for a certain specific sporting field has performed exceedingly well over the years in the different district, state, and national levels. In contrast, a few others have not shown a comparable success rate. The fields in which there has been an impressive performance are Athletics, Wrestling, Basketball, Cycling, Hockey, and Football. (See Table 21). These disciplines deserve further attention and, as an incentive, more significant budgetary allocations. By witnessing such enhancement, other sports can gear-up them in such a way to be more considerate towards its beneficiaries and also pay attention to the financial allowances. Nurturing and augmentation of infrastructure in these select fields can follow public-private collaboration.

The study finds, amongst the inmates of sports hostels, nearly in all branches of sports disciplines, an unevenness of social inclusiveness representing a more comprehensive range of social and or ethnic backgrounds. A majority of them hail from relatively lower-income households, suggesting that the wealthier ones tend to enroll themselves in private sports training academies or institutions. Besides this, what is perhaps not so welcome is the fact that there is an uneven representation of beneficiaries of hostels and other infrastructural facilities from religious backgrounds. These facilities have not been able to attract sports persons from Muslim, Christian, and other religious minorities. Considering the sociopsychological importance of sports for a nation that, too, a pluralist society as ours, there is a need to encourage sportspersons from diverse social backgrounds to train and participate in competitions. However, it is a laudable fact that as high as 25.08 percent of hostel in-mates hail from the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe background. Especially the higher participation by these two communities reflects a practical implementation of special subplans oriented towards these two social groups. In the absence of such facilities, it may have been nearly impossible for potential sportspersons from such backgrounds to get trained and or perform impressively at various levels of competitions.

A repetitive request made by nearly all the stakeholders – players past and present, current inmates, coaches, members of respective sports associations – pertained to the need for a gender desegregated hostel in the different districts. In a patriarchal conservative society, the absence of such a gender-specific hostel, indeed, dissuaded many talented young girls from opting to train themselves as residents in such combined hostels.

Another important but quite frequently under-reported hardship raised by both the past and present sportswomen across the discipline was the presence of gender-based discrimination to throttle the dream of a potential champion. There have also been instances of harassment of women sportspersons. Often the fear of adverse consequences of any revelation of such cases prevented many from making any formal complaint. Such incidences call for a more vigilant grievance redressal mechanisms as per *Vishakha* guidelines. As such, there had been no such committees in place, or even if they were constituted, they had remained merely on paper.

One of the critical concerns of the evaluation was to assess the satisfaction of the residents on the various facilities provided in the sports hostel, including the food served. As a whole, over 80 percent of residents had expressed satisfaction over the type and quality of accommodation given to them in the hostels. Interestingly, however, districts such as Vijayapura (78.2%), Bengaluru (46.8%), and Gadag (38.2%) had a relatively higher proportion of dissatisfied beneficiaries than the rest. Quality and quantity of food, location of the hostel in noisy surroundings and absence of sufficient infrastructure benefits were the main factors over which there had been dissatisfaction with the hostel facilities. Residents of Bengaluru hostels were much more vocal, aware, and assertive of their rights as compared to the residents in distant districts.

There is a wide variation in the perception of the residents across the districts in terms of quantity and quality of food served in these hostels. In regard to whether or not they were served the requisite quantity of food, a majority made up of 77.8 per cent were satisfied that it met their requirement. But nearly half the respondents in Gadag hostel were unhappy with both the quantity and quality of food served. In respect of the quality of food, the Vijayapura has overwhelmingly reported as of 'poor.' (Table 16). The study finds it necessary that a monitoring team ought to visit these hostels at random and periodically to ensure that the facilities are of intended quality.

Which of the sports is enabling better against others? An attempt was made in this evaluation to make an assessment of this by examining the number of medals and awards won at different levels of competition in each sport. Interestingly, it is also visible that discipline with more students' intake is performing better over others as this has its root in the sporting culture of the region. It is evident that in respect of individual sports, despite the impressive number of residents in the hostels or the amount of competitions in which they have participated, the outcome in terms of medals won has been very poor: But in a few other

**Executive Summary** 

sports, there is a very high performance (in terms of medals won) despite the number of inmates in hostels being low. In other words, the residential facilities and training provided to the sportspersons in different fields in Karnataka are yielding an impressive result, although there is room for further improved performance. The latter is particularly applicable to some sports where the return is not up to the mark: Kabaddi, Judo, and Volleyball.

The sampled districts with their corresponding sports disciplines were sought to be ranked in respect of the quality of different aspects of the facility, by the sports association representatives. These qualities ranged from the facilities in hostels and in training centers; level of participation in competitions, quality of coaching available, sporting equipment' availability, or medical facilities, etc. Taken together, the Hostels in Mysuru, Bengaluru and Belagavi were ranked the first three respectively. Districts of Raichur (13), Haveri (12) Vijayapura (11) and Chikkamagaluru (10<sup>th</sup>) were ranked at the lower end. Some such districts assessed poorly require immediate attention not merely in improving quality in multiple respects but also in regard to boosting the morale of the inmate trainees. Low morale could lead to poorer performance in sporting competitions also.

The evaluation had focused its attention also in seeking perceptions of the other stakeholders such as representatives of the sports associations, former award winners and champions, sports journalists, and the coaches – present and past – in specific disciplines. When such stakeholders are constantly consulted or their opinions are taken into account in formulating the long term policies or short-run interventions, there is a healthy atmosphere of a good blend of past experience and current performance. The overall impression one gets by holding discussions with such experts is not completely satisfactory, for each has one or the other thing to be not happy with. Without attributing any motives to some such observations made by the different stakeholders (for, in FGDs such accusations became quite frequent) the evaluation takes note of some of the key issues: Paucity of funds, inadequate infrastructure - especially as compared to a few other sport disciplines, absence of professionalism, competition from private sector especially in attracting capable and competent coaches, inability to recognize individual sportsperson's talents and/or drawback, not offering good pay-package to the coaches, cash award being too small, etc. Formal associations of nearly all the sports-disciplines call for a greater role by the state in facilitating sponsorship by private bodies both for the training of talented sportspersons and holding of competitive events. More or less, a uniform view expressed by the different stakeholders was that the state of Karnataka should strive harder through different sporting

Karnataka Evaluation Authority | 5

bodies in attracting national and international competitive events within the state and across the different parts of the state. This not only enables the different disciplines to develop the infrastructure but also encourages greater popularity of such sports.

#### **Recommendations/Policy Suggestions:**

Because this evaluation focused on different sport disciplines and diverse stakeholders, the recommendations too ought to be reflecting such diversity. Accordingly, the set of recommendations are grouped under four broad categories, focusing on a) Sports Hostels; b) Standards of Coaching; c) Improving organizational efficiency; d) and about optimum utilization of available infrastructure:

#### A. Sports Hostels

- The provision of better medical facilities for the trainee sportspersons in the hostels is an urgent requirement. Arrangements to be made to engage the services of physiotherapists and physicians in the district centers with a proper tie-up with the existing public health centers.
- 2. The state of Karnataka should explore the possibilities of introducing a secure Health and Accident Insurance scheme for the inmates of the sporting hostels and the participants of competitive events at all levels.
- 3. Satisfactory management of sports hostels as per requirement needs immediate appointment of wardens at regular basis (not on outsource basis) who could be held accountable.
- 4. The supply of sporting equipment (dress, shoes, play-things, etc.) needs to be streamlined both for timely availability and quality.
- Provisioning of gender-specific hostels and other facilities in the training centers. Likewise, providing experts to suit the gender differences in different fields of sporting specialization.
- 6. Set up a transparent, proactive Grievance Redressal System, and frame a clear Gender Policy document to accommodate the LGBTQ population in sports
- Undertake individual campaigns to make the hostel and training facilities to be socially more inclusive – specially to draw participation from minority groups.

## **B.** Coaching

- 1. Pay package and incentives to the Coaches to be standardized and in keeping with the changing scene in the private sector so as to attract good talent and greater commitment.
- 2. Introduce, on the lines of National Institute of Sports (Patiala), State Level Coaching Certification program to increase the Supply of Qualified Coaches at the local level.
- 3. Private sports coaching attracts high GST (18%), and suitable reduction or exemptions are recommended.

## **C. Organizational Efficiency:**

- 1. Duty-free import of sports goods (which is as high as 29-30 percent) for DYES certified players needs to be boosted.
- **2.** Creation of State Sports Authority to coordinate among National bodies, DYES, Private funding, Sports associations, Universities, and colleges (both public and private), schools, and other private coaching initiatives.
- **3.** Evolve a policy for adequate funding and support with a better Private-Public collaboration as outlined in this report (Details of various PPP models are discussed in the section: 9.4).
- 4. Immediate enhancement of the staff strength of the Department of Sports and filling up of vacancies are the need of the hour. Presently DYES is working on only 47.47% of its actual strength. Especially taluka level staffs need to be appointed immediately.
- 5. Improving the Documentation standard by DYEs which needs to address the issue of the unsatisfactory nature of documentation and maintenance of beneficiaries' records as this would not only help the Sports Department to go for monitoring the progress of sports and principal beneficiaries but also enable framing meaningful policies.
- 6. Attempts to be made to hosting International and national level sporting events at regular intervals to boost infrastructure development.

## **D.** Optimum Utilization of Infrastructure:

- Many sporting infrastructure facilities in the state have occupancy rates below 50% throughout the year due to an improper monetization strategy. Franchise-based sporting leagues will help in revenue generation through optimum utilization of existing facilities and more significant opportunities for local talents
- 2. Rather than investing in more significant infrastructure with higher investment Government must concentrate on Low-Cost School-Based smaller infrastructures under the public-private collaboration. Government schools could be the focal point.

Indicators	Objectives	Findings	Suggestions
Interventions	To examine interventions	Creation of Infrastructure- Stadium and Youth	Creation of State sports authority to
	in the mentioned sports	Training Centers.	coordinate among National bodies, DYES,
	by the state for the last	Youth Empowerment Programs.	Private funding, Sports associations,
	five years 2012-13 to	Youth Festival, Youth Rally, Conferences, and Youth	Universities, and colleges schools with
	2016-17.	Awards.	powerful budgetary support.
		Youth Training Programs.	
		Sports Schools and Hostels.	
		Sports Events- Taluka, District, and State Level.	
		Sports Awards - Ekalavya, Karnataka Kreeda Rathna,	
		and Lifetime Achievement Awards.	
		Sports welfare- Cash Incentive, Scholarships,	
		Insurance, pension, and Promotion of Excellence	
		under Sports Academy for Excellence scheme.	
	Number of Students	2011-1196	
	Admitted to the Sports	2012-1509	
	Schools/Hostels	2013-1541	
		2014-1766	
		2015-1851	
		2016- 1897	

# **Evaluation Findings and Suggestions through Evaluation Matrix**

Budgetary expenditure	2012-13 -7796 (lakhs)	Private sector participation in sports
	2013-14-7011	infrastructure development through:
	2014-15-10291	Promotion of crowd funding through citizen
	2015-16-8068	participation (Olympic Gold Quest).
	2016-17-10647	
Role and extent of	Private coaching and private academies (Padukone-	Creation of special sports zones (SSZs) and
involvement of the	Dravid) are there and doing excellent job in	Sports cities.
private sector in the selec	disciplines like Athletics, badminton, swimming and	Through Corporate Social Responsibility
sports	cricket but there is no successful private-public	(Gopichand-Academy, Padukone-Dravid
	cooperation. An initiative from Jindal on Kanteerava	Academy).
	stadium has failed miserably. There are good private	57
	initiatives and significant public initiatives. But no	Updating Revenue generation opportunities
	proper and successful convergence between the has	following either Greenfield (BOT) or
	happened. This calls for a detailed road map for PPP	Brownfield (RMO) model.
	in sports of Karnataka.	Introducing more professionalism and
		accountability in DYES and other sports
		Associations.
		The government should seriously consider
		broadcasting and media rights of various
		disciplines to increase their popularity and
		visibility.

Social	Success of	the	More than 90 per cent of the students from the sports	DYES should promote exclusive awareness
Inclusivity	interventions	in	hostels are Hindus, followed by Muslims (4%) and	drive among Muslims (only 4% of
	attracting students fi	rom	Christians (1.3%). However, more than 25.08 percent	beneficiaries) to attract their attention to
	diverse background		of Hindu students are coming from SC/ST category.	sports.
			Gender wise representation of hostel students: 59% male and 41% female.	Establishment of Separate Ladies Hostel in each district.
				DYES must set up a transparent, proactive Grievance Redressal System, and frame a clear Gender Policy document to accommodate the LGBTQ population in sports.
				Duty-free import of sports goods (which is as high as 29-30 percent) for DYES certified players needs to be boosted.

Performance	Returns in terms of		Focused priority on achieving Excellence in
	passing out students	50.0 45.0 43.8	Selected sports with a proven track record
	remaining in the field of	40.0	through PPP model
	sports, awards, and prizes	35.0 30.0 <u>28.7</u>	
	won, representation at	25.0	
	various levels of	15.0	
	competitive events,	10.0	
			Hosting International and national level
		0.0	sporting events at regular intervals to boost
		anator vation star	performance as well as infrastructure
		The second	development.
		Medals won during evaluation:	
		International level: 07	
		National level: 460	
		State level: 2801	
		In spite of success at the state and National level most	
		of the DYES trained students have failed to make a	
		mark at international level.	
		Table 21 reflects the ranking of disciplines in terms	
		of medals own at different levels of competitions.	
		1. Athletics 2. Wrestling 3. Basketball 4.	
		Cycling 5. Hockey	

Infrastructure	views of Associations	Conditions of Sports hostels:	Payment of Standard Remuneration to
	and Federations of the		coaches with the security of tenure.
	selected sports	Respondents are generally (81.2%) are happy with the	
	concerning the	status of accommodation. The majority of the unhappy	In the line of National Institute of Sports,
	challenges, limitations,	lot is from Bengaluru (46.8%), Gadag (38.2%), and	(Patiala), the introduction of State Level
	infrastructural needs, and	Vijayapura (78.2%).	Coaching Certification to increase the
	opportunities for growth of the respective fields	The majority of the respondents (77.8%) consider the quantity of the food as just adequate. However,	Supply of Qualified Coaches at the local level.
		respondents from Vijayapura overwhelmingly (72.7%)	Rather than investing in massive
		commented on the poor quality of food.	infrastructure with higher investments, the
		On standards of infrastructural facilities provided at the hostel level, only 6.3% of respondents consider that as international standard while the majority of them (42.9%) rated it as state level and not even up to the National standard(Table:17). A glance into the necessary sports facilities shows that some districts are lacking even essential sports requirements like gym, synthetic track, indoor facilities, and swimming pools (Table 18). Only 18.8% of respondents opined that coaching facilities provided by DYES are as per the	<ul> <li>Government must concentrate on Low-Cost</li> <li>School-Based smaller infrastructures under</li> <li>the public-private collaboration.</li> <li>To bring down the running cost of sports</li> <li>infrastructure facilities have to invest in</li> <li>Technology-Enabled smart stadiums run on</li> <li>solar powers.</li> </ul>

		National standard. Only Bagalkote (44.2%), Belagavi	
		(51.2%) and Bengaluru (31.9%) have claimed to have	
		access to standard international coaching. Interestingly	
		these centres cater to the top medal-winning	
		disciplines like wrestling, athletics, basketball, and	
		cycling (Table: 20). Composite index based ranking	
		of different districts based on facilities provided.	
		1. Mysuru, 2. Bengaluru 3. Belagavi 4. Mandya	
		5. Gadag 6. Davangere 7. Bagalkote 8. Kolar	
		9.Chitradurga 10.Chikmagalur 11.Vijayapura	
		12. Haveri 13. Raichur	
Sporting Eco-	Sustainable sports culture	Sports are still not mandatory in school curriculum.	Mandatory inclusion of sports in the school
system		Instead of encouragement, Sports achievers are rather	curriculum and having minimum facilities in
		penalized in terms of attendance and markings.	the schools.
		Mandatory participation in sports at school level needs	
		to be encouraged.	
			Introduction of Performance-based
		A public funded sporting infrastructure like	attendance relaxation and grace marks (Max.
		Kanteerava stadium encourages public participation in	25 in each subject based on the level of
		sports. Many more such bigger and smaller facilities	achievement: International-25 Max. and
		are required.	National- 15 max & Sate-10.as per

Organization of sporting event of International and	Karnataka Sports policy, 2018) at all levels
National level improves sporting eco-system and	from Primary to the University level. To
Karnataka is seriously lagging behind in this aspect.	facilitate parental support in considering
	sports as a viable career choice.
	Community participation in sports is the key
	to a healthy sporting eco-system. More local
	level sports events need to be organized for
	spotting talents and involving people from
	different backgrounds (e.g. Women.
	Elderlies, children, differentially abled )